

Design Review Board

P.O. Box 27210

Tucson, Arizona 85726-7210 Phone: (520) 791-4213 TDD: (520) 791-2639

Fax: (520) 791-2639

DESIGN REVIEW BOARD (DRB)

MEETING **N**OTICE AND AGENDA

Pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the **Design Review Board (DRB)** and to the general public that the Board will hold the following meeting which will be open to the public on:

Friday, February 15, 2019, 7:30 AM Public Works Building, Third Floor Conference Room 201 North Stone Avenue, Tucson, Arizona 85726

For wheelchair accommodations, materials in accessible formats, and/or materials in a language other than English, please contact Carolyn Laurie at (520) 837-4953, carolyn.laurie@tucsonaz.gov, or María Gayosso at (520) 837-6972, maria.gayosso@tucsonaz.gov, or (520) 791-2639 for TDD, no later than Wednesday February 13, 2019.

Para solicitar acomodamiento de sillas de ruedas, materiales es formatos accesibles, y/o materiales en español, por favor comuníquese con María Gayosso al (520) 837-6972, maria.gayosso@tucsonaz.gov, a más tardar el Miércoles 13 de Febrero de 2019.

AGENDA

1. Call to Order / Roll Call

Mike Anglin (Chair)
David Marhefka (Vice Chair)
Savannah McDonald
Nathan Kappler

- 2. Review and Approval of the 2/1/2019 Meeting Summary Action Item
- 3. Call to the Audience

4. Continued Case # DRB-19-01, Sit! Stay! Play!, 302 South Plumer Avenue, I-1 Zoning Associated Board of Adjustment Case # C10-19-07 (T19SA00035)

This case was continued by the DRB on February 1, 2019. The DRB asked applicant to return to the DRB with more specific design criteria of the proposed outdoor play area that justifies the need to reduce or eliminate required landscape buffer in the areas where new structures are being proposed.

The Applicant's Request:

The applicant is proposing a new Animal Services land use (dog daycare) on a 22,600 square-foot developed property. The existing 3,000 sq.ft. building will be renovated, and the south building will be replaced with a new 4,000 sq.ft. metal structure.

To preserve a large outdoor play area on site, the applicant is requesting the DRB to recommend for approval the following street landscape buffer-yard/screening modifications, reductions, and deletions:

- a) Along Plumer Avenue, delete the required 10'0" streetscape, and maintain the existing planters;
- b) Along 13th Street, reduce the width of the required 10'-0" streetscape to 8'-0", reduce the length of the streetscape from 83'-0" to 43'-0", and add a new planter; and
- c) Increase the screen perimeter wall height from 5'0" to 8'0".

In addition to the landscape and screening variances, the applicant will also request from the Board of Adjustment variances for parking, refuse collection access, pedestrian access, and building setbacks. The complete application can be viewed online:

https://www.tucsonaz.gov/pro/pdsd/permitdetail/T19SA00035/129042440

The DRB's Purview:

In accordance with UDC Sections 2.2.6.B.6, 2.2.6.C.5, 3.10.3, and 7.6.9.D, the DRB reviews and forwards a recommendation to the Board of Adjustment (B/A), all requests for variances from *UDC Section 7.6, Landscaping and Screening Standards*. In addition, the DRB may make any recommendation that would assist in mitigating any negative impacts, which might occur should the request be granted. The DRB may make a recommendation before the closure of this meeting or continue it to a specific date, time, and place provided the continuance is not for more than 120 days. In formulating its recommendation, the DRB shall apply the findings of approval of UDC Section 3.10.3.K.

Motion: THE DESIGN REVIEW BOARD (DRB) HAS REVIEWED THE PROPOSED STREET LANDSCAPE BUFFER-YARD/SCREENING MODIFICATIONS, REDUCTIONS, AND DELETIONS AND RECOMMENDS TO THE BOARD OF ADJUSTMENT (APPROVAL) (DENIAL), FINDING THE PROJECT (IN COMPLIANCE) (NOT IN COMPLIANCE) WITH THE CRITERIA ESTABLISHED IN UDC SECTION 3.10.3.K, ATTACHMENT A (SUBJECT TO THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS).

5. Case # RNA-DRB-19-05, Two New Doors for Former Arizona Hotel, 33 North 6th Avenue, OCR-2 Zoning (T19SA00048)

The Applicant's Request:

The applicant is proposing to modify storefront by sealing the existing entrance door and providing two new entrance doors in the wing storefront walls of the existing alcove, matching the construction of the existing door and storefront. The building is individually listed as historic and is within the boundaries of the Rio Nuevo Area and the Downtown Tucson Historic District. The proposal will also be reviewed by the Plans Review Subcommittee of the Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission.

The proposed modification to the existing storefront consists of the following:

- a) Secure the existing entry door to the existing frame;
- b) Remove the existing door pull from the interior and exterior side of the existing entry door;
- c) Remove the existing window frame assemblies in the north and south panels of the recessed alcove;
- d) Construct new door assemblies identical to the existing door assembly in the north and south panels of the alcove; and
- e) Provide an accessible metal threshold. Set in mastic to existing alcove floor (tile and glass block).

The DRB's Purview:

In accordance with UDC Section 2.2.6.C.14 and 5.12.7.F.3, the DRB reviews and forwards a recommendation all requests in the Rio Nuevo Area (RNA) to the Planning & Development Services (PDSD) Director, as provided in UDC Sections 5.12.2.C.1 and 5.12.4.D. In formulating its recommendation, the DRB shall apply the design standards in UDC Section 5.12.7.C.

Motion: THE DESIGN REVIEW BOARD (DRB) HAS REVIEWED THE APPLICANT'S PROJECT FOR COMPLIANCE WITH RIO NUEVO AREA DESIGN CRITERIA AND RECOMMENDS TO THE PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DIRECTOR (APPROVAL) (DENIAL), FINDING THE PROJECT (IN COMPLIANCE) (NOT IN COMPLIANCE) WITH THE BUILDING DESIGN STANDARDS SET FORTH IN UDC SECTION 5.12.7.C 1-15 (SEE ATTACHMENT B) (SUBJECT TO THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS).

6. Case # DRB-19-02, Central Block Rehabilitation, 98, 100, 108 & 110 East Congress Street, OCR-2 Zoning (T19SA00014)

The Applicant's Request:

This site consists of four historic buildings, of which two are individually listed as historic and two are eligible. The site is within the boundaries of the Rio Nuevo Area and the Downtown Tucson Historic District. The proposal will also be reviewed by the Plans Review Subcommittee of the Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission.

Portions of the building at 100, 108 and 110 East Congress Street were rehabilitated previously in 2013 and 2018. The stucco has been removed from the remainder of the building, decorative grates exposed and/or replaced with steel replicas, and miscellaneous brick repairs have been made.

The new proposal for the site is as follows:

- a) Rehabilitation the remainder of the north façade of the building, 98 East Congress Street only, Sheet H2:
 - i. Replace the clerestory windows that were originally on this façade with new blackened steel framed windows (3)
 - ii. replace lower storefront to match the clerestory windows and remainder of the storefronts on the building (3)
 - iii. tile the bottom portion of the storefront where it meets the sidewalk with gloss black 4"X4" tile (4)
 - iv. replace the awning fabric on the existing awnings and patina the awning enclosure (9)
- b) Rehabilitation of the northwest corner of the building, Sheet H3:
 - i. reconfigure double doors to expose the historic cast iron column(s) that were covered in a previous remodel, replace with steel/glass doors (3,6,9)
 - ii. replace the clerestory windows that were originally on this façade with new blackened steel framed windows (3)
 - iii. replace lower storefront to match the clerestory windows and remainder of the storefronts on the building (3)
 - iv. replace the awning fabric on the existing awnings and patina the awning enclosure (9)
- c) Rehabilitation of the west façade of the building, Sheet H4:
 - i. replace the clerestory windows that were originally on this façade with new blackened steel framed windows (3)
 - ii. replace lower storefront to match the clerestory windows and remainder of the storefronts on the building (3)
 - iii. replace the awning fabric on the existing awnings and patina the enclosure (9)
 - iv. continue the lower glass portion (without clerestory windows) of the storefront where openings were cut in during a previous remodel to match the remainder of this corner of the building (3)
 - v. tile the bottom of this portion of the storefront to match the north façade (4)
 - vi. surround steel columns from the previous remodel with salvaged brick from remainder of building (7)
 - vii. reopen two bricked in openings on the south half of the building and install blackened steel doors and windows (8)
 - viii. install new 8' awning over the restored openings (9)
- d) Rehabilitation of the south, secondary façade of the building, Sheet H4:
 - i. install windows in existing openings, some that were original to the building and some in new openings created by others in the past (10)
 - ii. uncover one original double hung wood window original window to remain (11)
 - iii. replace one solid metal door with steel and glass door (14)
 - iv. close one man door opening in an area that had been previously been what appear to be double doors originally, but that had been mostly closed in with CMU (12)
 - v. install new electrical service (07)
 - vi. install new down spouts (06)
 - vii. install a new steel picket fence patio enclosure with gates on south property line of 110 E. Congress (17, 18)

The DRB's Purview:

In accordance with UDC Sections 2.2.6.C.14 and 5.12.7.F.3, the DRB reviews and forwards a recommendation all requests in the Rio Nuevo Area (RNA) to the Planning & Development Services (PDSD) Director, as provided in UDC Sections 5.12.2.C.1 and 5.12.4.D. In formulating its recommendation, the DRB shall apply the design standards in UDC Sections 5.12.7.C and 5.12.7.D.

Motion: THE DESIGN REVIEW BOARD (DRB) HAS REVIEWED THE APPLICANT'S PROJECT FOR COMPLIANCE WITH RIO NUEVO AREA DESIGN CRITERIA AND RECOMMENDS TO THE PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DIRECTOR (APPROVAL) (DENIAL), FINDING THE PROJECT (IN COMPLIANCE) (NOT IN COMPLIANCE) WITH THE BUILDING DESIGN STANDARDS SET FORTH IN UDC SECTION 5.12.7.C 1-15, AND SITE DESIGN STANDARDS SET FORTH IN UDC SECTION 5.12.7.D (SEE ATTACHMENT B) (SUBJECT TO THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS).

7. Case #DRB-19-06, Arizona Vascular Specialists, 6432 & 6442 East Speedway Boulevard, R-1 Zoning, proposed O-1 Zoning (T19SA00047, C9-18-20)

The Applicant's Request:

The applicant is proposing the rezoning of two properties from R-1 to O-1, to construct a new, one story, 14,000 square-foot outpatient medical office building. The applicant is proposing the following design details:

- a) Building massing articulated to minimize large masses and blank walls.
- b) While the façade is contemporary in design, it echoes the modernity of the adjacent neighborhood.
- c) The building utilizes three colors of stucco that are compatible with the adjacent office building. In addition, metal facias, the color of weathered metal will be used on the accent towers and also have 2' x 2' sand texture ceramic tile accents.
- d) The scale of our building compliments the adjacent office and is setback approximately 80 ft. from the residences to the south.
- e) The project will have rooftop mechanical units, fully shielded with 4' 0'' high parapets.
- f) A diesel generator will be needed for the surgical suite, which will be behind a screen wall.
- g) Exterior lighting will be LED's with light source fully shielded to comply with the dark sky ordinance.
- h) The block wall on the south side of the property will be extended to match the existing wall that sits 5' 0'' away from the property line to allow maintenance.

The DRB's Purview:

In accordance with UDC Section 4.9.4.R.7, the DRB reviews and forwards a recommendation to the Planning & Development Services (PDSD) Director. In formulating its recommendation, the DRB shall apply the design standards in UDC Section 4.9.4.R.7.

Motion: THE DESIGN REVIEW BOARD (DRB) HAS REVIEWED THE APPLICANT'S PROJECT FOR THE PROPOSED REZONING TO 0-1 AND RECOMMENDS TO THE PLANNING & DEVELOPMENT SERVICES (PDSD) DIRECTOR (APPROVAL) (DENIAL), FINDING THE PROJECT (IN COMPLIANCE) (NOT IN COMPLIANCE) WITH THE CRITERIA ESTABLISHED UDC SECTION 4.9.4.R.7 (SEE ATTACHMENT C) (SUBJECT TO THE FOLLOWING CONDITIONS).

8. Adjournment.

<u>ATTACHMENT A:</u> VARIANCE FOR LANDSCAPE & SCREENING SUBSTITUTIONS

In accordance with UDC Sections 2.2.6.B.6, 2.2.6.C.5, 3.10.3, and 7.6.9.D, the DRB reviews and forwards a recommendation to the Board of Adjustment (B/A), all requests for variances from *UDC Section 7.6, Landscaping and Screening Standards*. In addition, the DRB may make any recommendation that would assist in mitigating any negative impacts, which might occur should the request be granted. The DRB may make a recommendation before the closure of this meeting or continue it to a specific date, time, and place provided the continuance is not for more than 120 days. The DRB shall apply the same findings of approval required of the B/A when making its recommendation.

UDC Section 3.10.3.K Findings for Approval

The B/A may approve a variance only if it finds:

- 1. That, because there are special circumstances applicable to the property, strict enforcement of the UDC will deprive such property of privileges enjoyed by other property of the same classification in the same zoning district;
- 2. That such special circumstances were not self-imposed or created by the owner or one in possession of the property;
- 3. That the variance granted is subject to such conditions as will assure that the adjustment authorized shall not constitute a grant of special privileges inconsistent with the limitations upon other properties in the vicinity and zone in which such property is located;
- 4. That, because of special circumstances applicable to the property, including its size, shape, topography, location, and surroundings, the property cannot reasonably be developed in conformity with the provisions of the UDC;
- 5. That the granting of the variance shall not be detrimental to the public welfare or injurious to other property or improvements in the neighborhood in which the property is located;
- 6. That the proposed variance shall not impair an adequate supply of light and air to adjacent property, substantially increase congestion, or substantially diminish or impair property values within the neighborhood; and,
- 7. That the variance, if granted, is the minimum variance that will afford relief and is the least modification possible of the UDC provisions that are in question.

ATTACHMENT B: RIO NUEVO AREA (RNA) DESIGN CRITERIA

In accordance with UDC Section 2.2.6.C.14 and 5.12.7.F.3, the DRB reviews and forwards a recommendation all requests in the Rio Nuevo Area (RNA) to the Planning & Development Services (PDSD) Director, as provided in UDC Sections 5.12.2.C.1 and 5.12.4.D. In formulating its recommendation, the DRB shall apply the design standards in UDC Section 5.12.7.C and UDC Section 5.1.7.D.

UDC Section 5.12.7.C Rio Nuevo Area - Building Design Standards

Development within the RNA is required to comply with the following building design standards:

- The proposed buildings shall respect the scale of those buildings located in the development zone and serve
 as an orderly transition to a different scale pursuant to Section 5.12.8.B, Development Transition Standards.
 Building heights with a vastly different scale than those on adjacent properties should have a transition in
 scale to reduce and mitigate potential impacts. In areas undergoing change, long range plans should be
 consulted for guidance as to appropriate heights;
- 2. All new construction must be consistent with the prevailing setback existing within its development zone except that the PDSD Director may approve a different setback than the prevailing setback upon a written finding during the review process that a different setback is warranted by site conditions or applicable development design goals consistent with Section 5.12.1, *Purpose*, and the proposed setback will not be incompatible with adjacent properties, as defined in Section 11.4.2.A;
- 3. All new construction shall provide scale defining architectural elements or details at the first two floor levels, such as windows, spandrels, awnings, porticos, cornices, pilasters, columns, and balconies;
- 4. Every commercial building frontage shall provide windows, window displays, or visible activity within and adjacent to the building at the ground floor level, with a minimum of 50 percent of the building frontage providing such features;
- 5. A single plane of a façade at the street level may not be longer than 50 feet without architectural relief or articulation by features such as windows, trellises, and arcades;
- 6. Building façade design shall include pedestrian-scaled, down-shielded, and glare controlled exterior building and window lighting;
- 7. street and visually highlighted by graphics, lighting, marquees, or canopies;
- 8. Modifications to the exterior of historic buildings shall complement the overall historic context of the Downtown and respect the architectural integrity of the historic façade;
- 9. Buildings shall be designed to shield adjacent buildings and public rights-of-way from reflected heat and glare;
- 10. Safe and adequate vehicular parking areas designed to minimize conflicts with pedestrians and bicycles shall be provided;
- 11. Adequate shade shall be provided for sidewalks and pedestrian pathways, using shade structure or vegetation, where permitted by the City;
- 12. Colors may conform to the overall color palette and context of the Downtown area or may be used expressively to create visual interest, variety, and street rhythms. The rationale for an expressive or idiosyncratic use of color shall be described in the site plan submittal;
- 13. New buildings shall use materials, patterns, and elements that relate to the traditional context of the Downtown area;
- 14. Twenty-four-hour, street-level activity is encouraged by providing a mixture of retail, office, and residential uses within each building; and,

<u>ATTACHMENT B:</u> RIO NUEVO AREA (RNA) DESIGN CRITERIA (Continued)

15. Primary public entries shall be directly accessed from a sidewalk along a street rather than from a parking lot. Public access to commercial and governmental buildings shall be provided at sidewalk grade. The primary floor of, and access to, residential structures may be elevated. Secondary access may be provided from off-street parking areas.

UDC Section 5.12.7.D Rio Nuevo Area – Site Design Standards

Development within the RNA is required to comply with the following site design standards:

1. Vehicular Circulation

- a. All parking area access lanes (PAALs)adjacent to buildings shall have pedestrian circulation paths between the PAAL and the building, with a minimum width of six feet.
- b. The locations of all points of vehicular ingress and egress shall be perpendicular to the intersecting street. Points of ingress and egress points shall be designed to minimize vehicular/pedestrian and vehicular/bicycle conflicts. Adequate storage for vehicular queuing at parking facilities shall be contained on site. Right turn bays are strongly discouraged. Points of ingress and egress shall be minimized wherever possible. Additional temporary ingress and egress locations may be permitted for parking structures when occasional high peak period traffic flows (i.e., parking facilities for event venues) are anticipated.

2. Parking

- a. General Parking standards are listed in Section 7.4. Some properties in the RNA may also be located in the Downtown Parking District, which allows a reduction in the number of parking spaces as provided in Section 7.4.5.B.
- b. Screening of Parking All new parking shall be designed so that vehicles are not visible from the adjoining street level, through incorporation of pedestrian arcades, occupied space, or display space.
- c. Employee Parking Employee parking for all uses should be provided at remote locations in order to maximize the availability of space for development.

3. Plazas and Open Space

The fundamental objective of the design standards in this Section 5.12.7.D.3 is to encourage public and private investments to enhance the character and function of Downtown's pedestrian environment.

a. Plazas and Pedestrian Nodes

Five percent of the gross floor area of new construction shall be provided in public plazas or courtyards. Open space plazas, courtyards, and patios are landscaped outdoor areas designed to accommodate multiple uses, from large gatherings of the people for performing arts to smaller gatherings. The plazas and courtyards will be one of the ways that spaces and uses can be linked. The requirement of this section may be waived or reduced by the PDSD Director upon a written finding during the review process that the development enhances the downtown pedestrian environment even with a smaller percent or elimination of the requirement.

<u>ATTACHMENT B:</u> RIO NUEVO AREA (RNA) DESIGN CRITERIA (Continued)

b. Viewshed Corridors

Views of all historic properties and all natural elements surrounding the Downtown should be considered during design. Plazas, courtyards, and open spaces shall be sited to include views to other public spaces, where feasible.

c. Linkages (Physical and Visual)

Neighborhood linkages shall be maintained throughout Downtown.

4. Streetscape

a. Streetscapes must be consistent with the Streetscape Design Policy. In streetscape design, priority is given to pedestrians.

b. Shade

Shade shall be provided for at least 50 percent of all sidewalks and pedestrian pathways as measured at 2:00 p.m. on June 21 when the sun is 82° above the horizon (based on 32°N Latitude). Shade may be provided by arcades, canopies, or shade structures, provided they and their location and design characteristics are compatible with the prevailing and design context of the street and the architectural integrity of the building. Deciduous trees, as proposed in the Downtown Comprehensive Street Tree Plan, are encouraged to supplement existing evergreen trees. The use of plantings and shade structures in the City right-of-way are permitted to meet this standard with the approval of the Department of Transportation. The shade provided by a building may serve to meet this standard.

<u>ATTACHMENT C:</u> <u>OFFICE COMPATIBILITY STANDARDS FOR OUTPATIENT MEDICAL SERVICE IN O-1 ZONING</u>

UDC SECTION 4.9.4.R.7 – Office Compatibility Standards

New construction shall be reviewed by the Design Review Board (DRB) for architectural and site design compatibility with the surrounding residential area. The DRB review shall include architectural style, building elevations, materials on exterior facades, color schemes, new mechanical equipment locations, lighting of outdoor areas, window locations and types, screening, landscaping, vehicular use areas, and other contributing design features. The DRB recommendation shall be made to the PDSD for determination of compatibility. The DRB shall find that:

- a. The building materials on the exterior facade are compatible with those used within the neighborhood block;
- b. Color schemes of the new building are compatible with those of the developments on the block face;
- c. The exterior facade of new construction is of a residential type architecturally if adjacent to a residential use or vacant residentially zoned property;
- d. The building scale of new construction complements, rather than is dominant in scale to, adjacent projects; and,
- e. Any new mechanical equipment located on the roof are screened and that the screen is integrally designed as part of the architectural style of the building. If this cannot be done, the equipment shall be located at ground level and screened from the street.